

# CONTENTS

- 1 Determinants of Enterprise Performance in Latin America and the Caribbean: What Does the Micro-Evidence Tell Us?** 1  
Matteo Grazzi, Carlo Pietrobelli, and Adam Szirmai
- 2 Innovation Dynamics and Productivity: Evidence for Latin America** 37  
Gustavo Crespi, Ezequiel Tacsir, and Fernando Vargas
- 3 Innovative Activity in the Caribbean: Drivers, Benefits, and Obstacles** 73  
Preeya Mohan, Eric Strobl, and Patrick Watson
- 4 Information and Communication Technologies, Innovation, and Productivity: Evidence from Firms in Latin America and the Caribbean** 103  
Matteo Grazzi and Juan Jung
- 5 On-the-Job Training in Latin America and the Caribbean: Recent Evidence** 137  
Carolina González-Velosa, David Rosas, and Roberto Flores

<b>6</b>	<b>Business Performance in Young Latin American Firms</b>	167
	Hugo Kantis, Juan Federico, Pablo Angelelli, and Sabrina Ibarra García	
<b>7</b>	<b>Different Obstacles for Different Productivity Levels? An Analysis of Caribbean Firms</b>	207
	Alison Cathles and Siobhan Pangerl	
<b>8</b>	<b>Credit Access in Latin American Enterprises</b>	245
	Andrea F. Presbitero and Roberta Rabellotti	
<b>9</b>	<b>International Linkages, Value-Added Trade, and Firm Productivity in Latin America and the Caribbean</b>	285
	Pierluigi Montalbano, Silvia Nenci, and Carlo Pietrobelli	
<b>10</b>	<b>Innovation and Productivity in Latin American and Caribbean Firms: Conclusions</b>	317
	Matteo Grazzi, Carlo Pietrobelli, and Adam Szirmai	
	<b>Index</b>	325

## EDITORS

*Matteo Grazzi* is a Specialist in the Competitiveness and Innovation Division of the Inter-American Development Bank (IDB). Before joining the IDB, Matteo worked as a consultant economist at the UN Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean (ECLAC) in Santiago, Chile, and as a researcher at the Centre for Research on Latin American and Transition Economies Studies (ISLA) at Bocconi University in Milan, Italy. He holds a PhD in International Law and Economics from Bocconi University and an MA in Development Economics from the University of Sussex (Brighton, UK). His main research interests focus on international and development economics, economics of innovation, and ICT for development.

*Carlo Pietrobelli* is a Lead Specialist in the Competitiveness and Innovation Division of the Inter-American Development Bank (IDB). Prior to joining the IDB, he was Professor of Economics and Director of the Center for Studies on the Economics of Institutions (CREI) at the University of Roma Tre in Italy. He also served as Deputy Rector for University–Industry linkages at the same university. He holds a PhD in Economics from the University of Oxford in the UK and has worked as policy advisor for international organizations such as the European Commission, the World Bank, IFAD, UNIDO, UNCTAD, ECLAC, CAF, and OECD in many countries in Africa, Asia, and Latin America. His research interests include innovation and technological change, industrial policy, international trade, clusters, and value chains in developing countries. Currently, Carlo designs and manages programs to promote competitiveness and innovation in Latin America and the Caribbean.



## EXTERNAL ADVISOR TO THE PROJECT

*Adam (Eddy) Szirmai* is Professorial Fellow at the UNU Maastricht Economic and Social Research Institute on Innovation and Technology (UNU–MERIT) and Professor of Development Economics at the Maastricht Graduate School of Governance of Maastricht University in the Netherlands. He holds a PhD in Economics from the University of Groningen and has published many books, including *Pathways to Industrialization in the 21st Century*, *New Challenges and Emerging Paradigms*, *Innovation in Theory and Practice*, *The Industrial Experience of Tanzania*, and *Entrepreneurship, Innovation and Development*, co-edited with Wim Naudé and Micheline Goedhuys. He is also currently working on a second edition of his textbook on development economics that was first published in 2005, *The Dynamics of Socio-Economic Development: An Introduction*. His research focuses on international comparisons of growth and productivity in manufacturing in developing countries, as well as, the relationships between innovation, technological change, and economic performance at sectoral level. He has been involved in research projects in manufacturing in Indonesia, China, South Korea, Tanzania, Zambia, South Africa, and Japan.



## CONTRIBUTORS

*Pablo Angelelli* is a Lead Specialist in the Competitiveness and Innovation Division of the Inter-American Development Bank (IDB), where he has worked since 2000. His current duties include the design and supervision of projects that support science, technology, and business innovation in Argentina, Paraguay, and Uruguay. He holds a degree in economics from the National University of Cordoba, Argentina, and has completed two Masters degrees: one in Public Policy at George Washington University in the USA and another in Economics and Industrial Development at the National University of General Sarmiento in Argentina. He is the author of numerous articles and several books on issues of SMEs, innovation, and technology-based ventures.

*Alison Cathles* is a PhD candidate in the Economics and Policy Studies of Technical Change at UNU-MERIT at Maastricht University in the Netherlands. She holds a Master of Public Administration from Cornell University in the USA. Before beginning her PhD studies, Alison worked as a consultant in the Competitiveness and Innovation Division of the IDB.

*Gustavo Crespi* is a Principal Specialist in the Competitiveness and Innovation Division of the IDB. He holds a PhD in Public Policy (with a specialization in Science and Technology Policy) from Sussex University in the UK, a Masters in Economic Development and International Trade from the School of Economics and Business Administration of the University of Chile, and a BA in Economics from the National University of Cordoba, Argentina. His interests include industrial development, technological change, industrial structure and development of the firm, and management and technology policy evaluation, especially in developing countries.

*Juan Federico* is a Researcher and Lecturer at the Entrepreneurial Development Program at the National University of General Sarmiento in Argentina, where he holds a Masters in Economics and Industrial Development with a focus on SMEs. He is a PhD candidate in Entrepreneurship and Small Business Management at the Autonomous University of Barcelona in Spain. His areas of interest include new firms, clusters, industrial policy, industrial sectors, and entrepreneurship policy.

*Roberto Flores Lima* is an international specialist and consultant on employment services, job training, and labor competency. From September 2008 to May 2015, Roberto was a Lead Specialist at the Labor Markets and Social Security Unit of the IDB, where he created the Technical Support Network of Public Employment Services in Latin America and the Caribbean (RED SEALC) and collaborated with the design of projects and loans for labor market issues Colombia, the Dominica Republic, Honduras, Mexico, Panama, and Peru. He holds a BA and MA in Economics from the National Autonomous University of Mexico and has a diploma in foreign trade and international business at the Autonomous Technological Institute of Mexico.

*Carolina González-Velosa* is an Economist in the Labor Markets and Social Security Unit of the IDB. She specializes in labor markets in developing countries, particularly in the areas of skills, training, intermediation, and migration. Her work has been published in leading academic journals such as the Journal of International Economics. She obtained a PhD in Economics from the University of Maryland, an MA from New York University, and a BA from the University of los Andes in Colombia.

*Sabrina Ibarra* is a Research Assistant and Lecturer at Prodem since she joined in 2008. She has been involved in several research projects in quantitative data processing and analysis. She has a Bachelor's Degree in Economics from the University of Buenos Aires in Argentina, with postgraduate studies in Industrial Economics and Development with a concentration in SMEs. Her main research interests are the determinants of dynamic new ventures (especially in Latin America), the elaboration of composite indicators of entrepreneurship, and quantitative research methods.

*Juan Jung* is the Studies and Regulation Coordinator at the Latin American Association of Research Centers and Telecom Enterprises (AHCJET). He is concurrently a PhD candidate in Economics at the University of Barcelona; he holds an MA in Economics from the same University. His area of expertise is applied economics and has been involved in a variety of consultancy projects with multilateral institutions over the past few years.

*Hugo Kantis* is Director of the Entrepreneurial Development Program at the National University of General Sarmiento in Argentina, where he leads a seminar-workshop for Professionals in the Entrepreneurial Ecosystem in Latin America. He holds a PhD in Economics and Business Science and a Master of Research in

Entrepreneurship and Business Strategy from the Autonomous University of Barcelona in Spain. He has consulted with numerous international organizations including the World Bank, IDB, ECLAC, UNDP, and JICA. His research focuses on entrepreneurship and entrepreneurial innovation, policy design, implementation and evaluation, SME development, and best practices for business and institutional management.

*Preeya Moban* is a Post-doctoral Research Fellow at the Sir Arthur Lewis Institute of Social and Economic Studies, Trinidad and Tobago, in the West Indies. She obtained her PhD in Economic Development Policy from the University of the West Indies, St. Augustine. Her thesis “Caribbean Development: The Role of Diversification and Hurricane Strikes” focuses on Caribbean growth and development primarily through diversification strategies and policies, and reducing vulnerability to climatic external shocks. She has worked on a wide range of topics including Caribbean economic history, natural disasters, financial economics, firm competitiveness and innovation, value chains, and clusters.

*Pierluigi Montalbano* is Associate Professor of International Economic Policy at the Sapienza University of Rome. His research interests include international economics and development, in particular the nexus between trade openness, instability and vulnerability in economies, multilateral and regional trade integration in emerging economies, and the theoretical and applied nexus between culture/creativity and local development.

*Silvia Nenci* is Assistant Professor in Economics at the University of Roma Tre in Rome, Italy. She holds a PhD in Economics from the Sapienza University of Rome. Her research focuses on international economics and economic policy. She has been consultant to several national and international institutions including the Italian Ministry of Foreign Affairs, the Global Development Network, and the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations.

*Siobhan Pangerl* is a Consultant in the Multilateral Investment Fund of the IDB, where she works on youth employment and entrepreneurship projects. Before this she worked for two years in the IDB’s Competitiveness and Innovation Division. She has experience working in various US government agencies including USAID and the State Department, and also spent two years as a Peace Corps volunteer in Peru. She has a Bachelor’s Degree in Communications from the University of Miami in the USA and has a Master in Public Policy and a Master of Science in Foreign Service, both from Georgetown University in the USA.

*Andrea Presbitero* is an Economist at the International Monetary Fund. He obtained a PhD in Economics from the Università Politecnica delle Marche in Ancona, Italy, an MA in Development Economics from the University of Sussex, UK, and an MSc in Political Economy from the University of Ancona in Italy. His research interests include development economics, fiscal policy and debt sustainability, banking and SME financing, and international economics.

**Roberta Rabellotti** is Professor of Economics at the University of Pavia, Italy. She holds an MSc in Development Economics from the University of Oxford and a PhD from the Institute of Development Studies at the University of Sussex, both in the UK. She specializes in the analysis of the industrial sector in developing countries and has experience consulting with the IDB, EU, UNIDO, ILO, ECLAC, and UNCTAD. Her areas of interest are industrial policies, small business promotion, international trade policies, industrial districts and clusters, and global value chains.

**David Rosas** is a Lead Specialist in the Labor Markets and Social Security Unit of the IDB, where he specializes in labor training and labor intermediation, and in evaluating the impact of labor market interventions. He holds a PhD and an MA in Economics from the University of Paris Panthéon-Sorbonne.

**Eric Strobl** is Associate Professor at Ecole Polytechnique in Paris, France, and External Professor at the Sir Arthur Lewis Institute of Social and Economic Studies at the University of the West Indies in Trinidad and Tobago. He holds a PhD in Economics from the University of Dublin, Trinity College, Ireland. His main research interests are in applied labor economics in developing countries, foreign direct investment, and economic geography.

**Ezequiel Tacsir** is Coordinator of the Information, Monitoring and Evaluation Unit of the Interdisciplinary Center for Science and Technology Studies (CIECTI, Argentina) and researcher at CINVE (Uruguay). In the past he occupied positions at the Competitiveness and Innovation Division (previously Science and Technology) of the IDB, UNU-MERIT, ProsperAr, and served as consultant for the World Bank, the IDB, and different national governments in science, technology, and innovation policies and studies. He studied economics at the University of Buenos Aires in Argentina. Ezequiel has achieved postgraduate awards in Science, Technology and Innovation Management (UNGS) and completed doctorate studies at UNU-MERIT. His research interests include STI policies, impact evaluation, and the interlink between human capital and innovation.

**Fernando Vargas** is a PhD Fellow in Economics and Governance at UNU-MERIT, specializing in the economics and policy studies of technical change. He holds a Master of Science degree in Applied Economics from the University of Chile and a Bachelor degree in Industrial Engineering from the same university. Before joining UNU-MERIT, he worked at the Competitiveness and Innovation Division of the IDB, where he held advisory and research management responsibilities for Latin American public agencies in the design and implementation of innovation surveys. His field of interest is mainly focused on understanding the determinants of innovation, innovation strategies, and productivity in firms in Latin America, and their implications for public policy design.

*Patrick Watson* is Director of the Sir Arthur Lewis Institute of Social and Economic Studies (SALISES) at the University of the West Indies in Trinidad and Tobago. He holds a PhD in Mathematical Economics and Econometrics and an MSc in Economics from the Panthéon-Sorbonne in Paris, France. His areas of expertise include the econometric modeling of Caribbean phenomena (in particular monetary and fiscal policy), economic measurement, and statistical analysis. He has served on the board of directors of various state enterprises, as a government senator, and on government committees.



# LIST OF FIGURES

Fig. 1.1	TFP relative to the United States (1960–2013)	3
Fig. 1.2	Productivity performance by country (2000–2011)	4
Fig. 1.3	LAC productivity distributions, 2010	6
Fig. 2.1	The heterogeneous productivity impacts of innovation	62
Fig. 3.1	Productivity distribution—labor productivity	83
Fig. 3.2	Non-innovative and weighted non-innovative firms—labor productivity	87
Fig. 3.3	Innovative and weighted non-innovative firms—labor productivity	88
Fig. 4.1	Fixed broadband subscriptions by region (2014)	105
Fig. 4.2	ICT diffusion in enterprises (2009–2010)	107
Fig. 4.3	ICT diffusion in LAC (latest available year)	109
Fig. 5.1	Incidence of training in LAC and the rest of the world	144
Fig. 5.2	Share of workers that received training by occupational category	145
Fig. 5.3	Proportion of firms that train by prioritized skill	147
Fig. 5.4	Percentage of firms offering OJT that received public support	149
Fig. 5.5	Determinants of the decision to train in LAC	152
Fig. 6.1	Composition of the sample according to the taxonomy of the growth and scale of young firms	176
Fig. 7.1	Caribbean firms by size (number of employees)	212
Fig. 7.2	ICT usage in the Caribbean	213
Fig. 7.3	(a) Export status; (b) domestic, indirect, and direct sales	215

Fig. 7.4	(a) Was the firm established Due to necessity? (b) what type of opportunity motivated the firm's creation?	217
Fig. 7.5	Previous occupation of the Top manager	218
Fig. 7.6	Full-time permanent employees with at least a bachelor's degree and population over age 25 that has completed tertiary education (%)	220
Fig. 7.7	Difficulty finding skills by job type (respondents who cited very difficult or almost impossible)	221
Fig. 7.8	The biggest obstacles by country	227
Fig. 8.1	Financing constraints and labor productivity	261
Fig. 8.2	Access to finance across the LAC region	262
Fig. 8.3	Financially constrained firms and credit market structure, by country	263
Fig. 8.4	The heterogeneous effect of foreign banks on financing constraints	271
Fig. 9.1	Gross export decomposition in value added	290
Fig. 9.2	Trade in value-added components: IVA and FVA	295
Fig. 9.3	GVC indicators: international comparison	295
Fig. 9.4	GVC industry position index	296

## LIST OF TABLES

Table 1.1	Growth accounting: LAC vs. comparison countries (1960–2011) (%)	2
Table 1.2	LAC firms participating in publicly supported programs	9
Table 1.3	LAC firms participating in publicly supported programs by firm size	10
Table 1.4	WBES: number of LAC firms surveyed	11
Table 2.1	Main variables used in the analysis	48
Table 2.2	The determinants of R&D investment	54
Table 2.3	The determinants of innovation outputs	57
Table 2.4	The impacts of innovation on productivity	59
Table 2.5	The impacts of innovation on productivity: the search for spillovers	61
Table 2.6	The heterogeneous impacts of innovation	63
Table 3.1	Summary statistics, WBES data	78
Table 3.2	Innovation activity (%)	79
Table 3.3	Product versus process innovation (%)	80
Table 3.4	Summary statistics, regression variables	81
Table 3.5	Kolmogorov–Smirnov test of productivity, innovative versus non-innovative	81
Table 3.6	Probability of investing in innovation (ID) and intensity of innovation expenditure per employee (IE)	82
Table 3.7	Probability of technological innovation	83
Table 3.8	The impact of innovation on labor productivity	85
Table 3.9	Main characteristics of Caribbean firms (%)	94
Table 3.10	Main characteristics of innovative Caribbean firms (%)	96
Table 3.11	Table of variables	97

Table 4.1	Descriptive statistics	108
Table 4.2	Determinants of broadband connection and using firm website: probit estimations	112
Table 4.3	Determinants of broadband connection and using firm website: biprobit estimations	113
Table 4.4	Determinants of broadband connection and using firm website: biprobit estimations by sector	114
Table 4.5	Determinants of broadband intensity of use: ordered probit and ordered probit with sample selection estimations	117
Table 4.6	Determinants of innovation	124
Table 4.7	Determinants of productivity	128
Table 5.1	Market failures that affect OJT	140
Table 5.2	Incidence and intensity of on-the-job training in LAC (sorted by incidence)	143
Table 5.3	Percentage of firms that do not train by reason not to provide training	150
Table 5.4	Characteristics of firms that train vs. firms that do not train	151
Table 5.5	Estimates of the impact of training on productivity	156
Table 5.6	Heterogeneous effects of training	157
Table 5.7	Providing and financing training services	161
Table 6.1	Taxonomy of young firms	176
Table 6.2	Productivity gap between young and mature firms by sector ( <i>median values</i> )	178
Table 6.3	Productivity growth between 2007 and 2009 by age and sector (median values)	178
Table 6.4	Productivity levels and growth according to the taxonomy of young firms by sector	179
Table 6.5	Regression outputs: labor productivity levels (in logs)	181
Table 6.6	Regression results: sales and employment growth	184
Table 6.7	Definition of independent variables	188
Table 6.8	Performance measures: descriptive statistics by firm age (full sample)	190
Table 6.9	Performance measures: descriptive statistics by sector (only young firms)	191
Table 6.10	Performance measures: descriptive statistics by country (only young firms)	193
Table 7.1	Brief characterization of Caribbean economies	209
Table 7.2	Firm characteristics by productivity level	223
Table 7.3	Top obstacle(s) cited by firms, 2010 vs 2013	226
Table 7.4	The biggest obstacle by productivity quintile	229
Table 7.5	Relating obstacles to different productivity quantiles	233
Table 7.6	Caribbean PROTEQin firm characteristics: high and low productivity	236

Table 7.7	Relating obstacles to different productivity quantiles (manufacturing only)	238
Table 8.1	Financing structure by firm characteristics and countries (% of working capital)	254
Table 8.2	Access to bank finance by firm characteristics and countries (%)	256
Table 8.3	Financing constraints by firm characteristics and countries (%)	259
Table 8.4	Constrained and discouraged borrowers	266
Table 8.5	Credit rationed borrowers	268
Table 8.6	The relative importance of firm and country-specific effects	270
Table 8.7	The role of credit market structure	272
Table 8.8	The differentiated effect of foreign banks on financing constraints	274
Table 8.9	Number of observations, 2006 and 2010	278
Table 9.1	Firms' international linkages and TiVA indicators for four LAC countries (2010)	293
Table 9.2	Export and FDI premiums	298
Table 9.3	Base model	299
Table 9.4	Instrumental variables 2SLS and CF (sample restricted to exporting firms)	302
Table 9.5	Value-added and GVC estimates (\$)	304
Table 9.6	The LAC sample: exporting, importing, and foreign-owned firms by country	306
Table 9.7	Gross export decomposition in value-added and GVC indicators in selected countries (2009)	307
Table 9.8	International comparison of GVC industry position index (2009)	308
Table 9.9	Variables used in the analysis	310